

University of Virginia  
Department of Politics  
Spring 2016

Denise Walsh  
S454 Gibson Hall: 982-2131  
Office Hours: by appointment  
[denise@virginia.edu](mailto:denise@virginia.edu)

PLCP 7500  
Tues. 7-9:30pm  
Gibson S441

### Identity and the State

What is identity? How are identities made? What are some of the challenges and consequences of identity and identity politics? This course investigates these questions through comparisons of class, race, gender, ethnicity, and nation during each class session. We begin with how social scientists define identity, the types of issues they study related to identity, and the shift at the turn of the century from treating identity as a given to studying it as a process.

The second section of the course considers two dominant and one emerging approach to identity formation in the social sciences—constructivism, instrumentalism, and neo-primordialism—and considers work that integrates a variety of approaches. We then turn to two pressing challenges for students of identity: how to measure it and the relationship of identities to one another. The final section of the course addresses the consequences of identity politics, exploring how and why identity groups mobilize; violence, conflict, and war among identity groups; and the relationship of identity to democracy, political parties, voting, representation, and social policy.

### Course Requirements

#### *Participation (20%)*

Students are expected to read the course material with care and to participate in class discussion. Attendance, preparation, and participation are expected and will be taken into account in assigning final grades. Each student also is responsible for opening up class discussion twice. While this might involve some summarizing of key arguments, the intent is to generate discussion around key issues. Students should focus on what they find to be interesting, problematic, or persuasive in the reading (5-10 minutes). Do not present long summaries of materials. Student presenters are encouraged to respond to posted reading reviews. Due anytime before class starts on Collab>Discussion and Private Messages>Worksite Discussions>Mini Presentations>Post Reply>Please change the subject line to your topic for the day and copy and paste your commentary into the box.

#### *Reading Reviews (25%)*

Each student will write a 600-700 word analysis of the readings for 5 of the 14 weeks. Students must not wait until the last 5 weeks of the course to write their reviews. Reviews

may briefly summarize the arguments of the chosen set of readings, but should focus principally on analysis and critique of the works discussed, as well as pose questions for further discussion. Due by Tuesday noon on Collab>Discussion and Private Messages>Worksite Discussions> Topic (for the class session)>Post Reply. Students should not post reading reviews for class sessions for which they are presenting.

*Final Assignment: Paper/Proposal (55%)*

Students will write either an analytical essay or a research paper (no longer than 20 pages), on a relevant topic of their choosing. Before spring break (by March 8) students must submit a one page proposal: Collab>Assignments>Proposal. The proposal should include the student's question and a statement of purpose that explains why the question is important and the steps the student plans to take to answer it. If appropriate, students may choose to write a dissertation proposal instead; the student must consult with her/his advisor as well as with the instructor on the proposal. Due Tuesday, May 10, before midnight: Collab>Assignments>Research Paper.

\*Occasional changes to this syllabus are possible and will be announced in advance.

**Course Outline**

***Part I. Definitions***

**Class 1 (Jan. 26): Introduction**

*What is identity?*

Discussion of the syllabus, assignments, etc.

James D. Fearon. 1999. "What is Identity (As We Now Use the Word)?" Unpublished.

One of the two articles below, depending on your research interests:

Mary Bernstein. 2005. "Identity Politics." *Annual Review of Sociology* 31: 47-74.

Rogers Brubaker and David D. Laitin. 1998. "Ethnic and Nationalist Violence." *Annual Review of Sociology* 24: 423-523.

*Recommended background reading to do before Class 4:*

Cris Toffolo. 2003. "Overview and Critique of the Present Research into the Politics of Cultural Pluralism." In Cris Toffolo ed. *Emancipating Cultural Pluralism*. Albany: SUNY Press: Ch. 1 (3-22).

Peter Bruland and Michael Horowitz. 2003. "Research Report on the Use of Identity Concepts in Comparative Politics." Harvard Identity Project.

**Class 2 (Feb. 2): Objective Definitions of Identities**

*What is a class? A woman? A race? An ethnicity? A nation?*

Erik Olin Wright. 1997. *Class Counts: Comparative Studies in Class Analysis*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 1 (1-37 only).

Simone de Beauvoir. Translation by Constance Borde and Sheila Mulvaney-Chevallier. 2009 [1949]. *The Second Sex*. New York: Alfred K. Knopf: Introduction (3-21).

W.E.B. Du Bois. 1995. "The Conservation of Races" [1897] and "Of Our Spiritual Strivings" [1903]. In David Levering Lewis, ed. *W.E.B. Du Bois: A Reader*. Henry Holt and Company: 20-33.

Donald L. Horowitz. 1985. *Ethnic Groups in Conflict*. Berkeley: University of California Press: Ch. 2 (55-92).

Ernest Renan. 1994. "Qu'est-ce qu'une nation? (What is a Nation?)" In J. Hutchinson and A. D. Smith (eds.) *Nationalism*. Oxford University Press: 17-18.

Max Weber. 1994. "The Nation." In J. Hutchinson and A. D. Smith, eds. *Nationalism*. Oxford University Press: 18-21.

### **Class 3 (Feb. 9): Subjective Definitions of Identities**

*If identities are not a thing but a process, what should social scientists study?*

E.P. Thompson. 1966. *The Making of the English Working Class*. Vintage Books: Preface (9-14).

Howard Winant. 2000. "Race and Race Theory." *Annual Review of Sociology* (26): 169-85.

Iris Marion Young. 2002. "Lived Body vs. Gender: Reflections on Social Structure and Subjectivity." *Ratio* 15 (4): 410-428

Mala Htun. 2005. "What It Means to Study Gender and the State." *Politics & Gender* 1 (1): 157-166.

Rogers Brubaker. 2002. "Ethnicity Without Groups." *European Journal of Sociology* 43(2): 163-189.

### **Part II. Identity Formation**

#### **Class 4 (Feb. 16): Constructivist Approaches**

*How do capitalism and the state shape identity formation?*

Erik Olin Wright. 1997. *Class Counts: Comparative Studies in Class Analysis*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 13 (373-406).

Anthony Marx. 1996. "Race-Making and the Nation-State." *World Politics* 48 (2): 180-208.

Maxine Molyneux. 2000. "Twentieth-Century State Formations in Latin America." In Elizabeth Dore and Maxine Molyneux, eds. *Hidden Histories of Gender and the State in Latin America*. Chapel Hill: Duke University Press: Ch. 2 (33-82).

Deborah Yashar. 2005. *Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements and the Postliberal Challenge*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 1 (3-19).

Rogers Brubaker. 1992. *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press: Introduction (1-21).

**Class 5 (Feb. 23): Instrumentalist Approaches**

*How does strategy shape identity formation?*

Vladimir Ilyich Lenin. 1902. "What is to be Done? Burning Questions of Our Movement." Ch. 2 and 3 (16-62).

Susan Franceschet. 2004. "Explaining Social Movement Outcomes: Collective Action Frames and Strategic Choices in First-and Second-Wave Feminism in Chile." *Comparative Political Studies* 37: 499-530.

Tali Mendelberg. 2001. *The Race Card: Campaign Strategy, Implicit Messages and the Norm of Equality*. Princeton: Princeton University Press: Ch. 1 (3-28).

Kanchan Chandra. 2004. *Why Ethnic Parties Succeed: Patronage and Ethnic Headcounts in India*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 1

Russell Hardin. 1995. *One for All: The Logic of Group Conflict*. Princeton: Princeton University Press: Ch. 1 (3-25).

**Class 6 (March 1): Neo-Primordial Approaches**

*How do culture and biology shape identity formation?*

Donald L. Horowitz. 2002. "The Primordialists." In Daniele Conversi, ed. *Ethnonationalism in the Contemporary World: Walker Connor and the Study of Nationalism*: Ch. 4 (72-81).

Charles Taylor. 1994. "The Politics of Recognition." In Amy Gutman, ed. *Multiculturalism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press: 25-73.

Kristen Renwick Monroe, James Hankin, and Renée Bukovchik Van Vechten. 2000. "The Psychological Foundations of Identity Politics." *Annual Review of Political Science* 3: 419-447.

Rose McDermott and Peter K. Hatemi. 2001. "Distinguishing Sex and Gender." *PS: Political Science & Politics* 44 (1): 89-92.

Gary R. Johnson. 1997. "The Architecture of Ethnic Identity." *Politics and the Life Sciences* 16 (2): 257-62.

**\*\*No Class March 8: Spring Break\*\*Final Assignment Proposal Due March 8\*\***

**Class 7 (March 15): Integrated Approaches**

*How might approaches for analyzing identity formation be combined?*

M. Granovetter and Charles Tilly. 1988. "Inequality and Labor Processes." *Handbook of Sociology*. Newbury Park: Sage Publications: (175-221).

Melissa Nobles. 2000. *Shades of Citizenship: Race and the Census in Modern Politics*. Stanford: Stanford University Press. Ch. 1 (1-24).

Susan Franchescet, Jennifer M. Piscopo and Gwynn Thomas. 2015. "Supermadres, Maternal Legacies and Women's Political Participation in Contemporary Latin America." *Journal of Latin American Studies*: 1-32.

Daniel Posner. 2005. *Institutions and Ethnic Politics in Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 1 (1-25).

Rogers Brubaker, Margit Feischmidt, Jon Fox, Liana Grancea. 2006. *Nationalist Politics and Everyday Ethnicity in a Transylvanian Town*. Princeton University Press: Introduction (1-19).

**Part III: Relationships and Measurement**

**Class 8 (March 22): Cross-cutting, Intersecting and Integrated Identities**

*How do different identities interact? If identities are not always distinct, how can they be analyzed?*

David Roediger. 1990. *The Wages of Whiteness: Race and the Making of the American Working Class*. New York: Verso: Ch. 7 (133-167).

Mary Hawkesworth. 2003. "Congressional Enactments of Race-Gender: Toward a Theory of Raced-Gendered Institutions." *American Political Science Review* 97 (4): 529-550.

Dara Z. Strolovitch. 2006. "Do Interest Groups Represent the Disadvantaged? Advocacy at the Intersections of Race, Class, and Gender." *Journal of Politics* 68 (4): 893-908.

Rogers Brubaker. 2015b. *Grounds for Difference*. Harvard: Harvard University Press: Ch. 3 (85-101).

Rogers Brubaker. 2015a. "The Dolezal Affair: Race, Gender, and the Micropolitics of Identity," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 39 (3): 414-448.

## **Class 9 (Mar. 29): Measurement**

*How should social scientists measure identity?*

Rawi Abdelal, Yoshiko Herrera, Alastair Iain Johnston and Rose McDermott. 2006. "Identity as a Variable." *Perspectives on Politics* 4(4): 695-711.

Erik Olin Wright. 1997. *Class Counts: Comparative Studies in Class Analysis*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 14 (407- 429 only)

Ange-Marie Hancock. 2007. "When Multiplication Doesn't Equal Quick Addition: Examining Intersectionality as a Research Paradigm." *American Political Science Review* 5 (1): 63-79.

Michael Dawson. 2009. "Black and Blue: Black Identity and Black Solidarity in an Era of Conservative Triumph." In Rawi Abdelal, Yoshiko Herrera, Alastair Iain Johnston and Rose McDermott, eds. *Measuring Identity: A Guide for Social Scientists*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 6 (175-199).

Henry Brady and Cynthia S. Kaplan. 2009. "Conceptualizing and Measuring Ethnic Identity." In Abdelal, et al., eds. *Measuring Identity: A Guide for Social Scientists*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 3 (33-71).

Bentley B. Allan and Ted Hopf. 2016. "Making Identity Count: Sequencing Methods in the Study of National Identity." *Qualitative & Multi-Method Research* 13 (2): 18-24.

## **Part IV: Consequences of Identity Formation**

### **Class 10 (April 5): Mobilization**

*How and why do identity groups mobilize?*

Ira Katznelson. 1986. "Introduction." In Ira Katznelson and Aristide Zolberg, eds. *Working Class Formation: Nineteenth-century patterns in Western Europe and the United States*. Princeton: Princeton University Press: 1-44.

Dennis Chong. 1991. *Collective Action and the Civil-Rights Movement*. Chicago: Chicago University Press: Ch. 1 and 3 (1-12 and 31-72).

Lisa Baldez. 2003. "Women's Movements and Democratic Transition in Chile, Brazil, East Germany and Poland." *Comparative Politics* 35 (3): 253-272.

Guillermo Trejo. 2009. "Religious Competition and Ethnic Mobilization in Latin America: Why the Catholic Church Promotes Indigenous Movements in Mexico." *American Political Science Review* 103: 323-342.

Mark Beissinger. 2002. *Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 1 (1-47.)

### **Class 11 (April 12) Violence, Conflict and War**

*What explains violence, conflict and war among identity groups?*

Karl Marx and Frederick Engels. 1998 [1848]. *The Communist Manifesto*. Any version is acceptable: Sections I-IV.

Sherene Razack. 2004. *Dark Threats and White Knights: The Somalia Affair*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press: Ch. 2 (51-86).

Dara Kay Cohen. 2013. "Explaining Rape during Civil War: Cross-National Evidence (1980-2009)." *American Political Science Review* 107 (3): 461-477.

James Fearon and David Laitin. 2003. "Ethnicity, Insurgency, and Civil War." *American Political Science Review* 97(1):1-17.

Jacques Bertrand. 2004. *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 2 (9-27).

### **Class 12 (April 19): Democracy and Party Politics**

*What is the relationship between identity and democracy? Between identity and party politics?*

Steven Levitsky and Scott Mainwaring. 2006. "Organized Labor and Democracy in Latin America." *Comparative Politics* 39 (1): 21-42.

Eileen McDonagh. 2002. "Political Citizenship and Democratization: The Gender Paradox." *American Political Science Review* 96: 535-552.

Mahmood Mamdani. 1996. *Citizen and Subject: Contemporary Africa and the Legacy of Late Colonialism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press: Ch.1 (3-34).

Kanchan Chandra. 2005. "Ethnic Parties and Democratic Stability." *Perspectives on Politics* 3(2): 235-252.

Simon Bornschier. 2010. *Cleavage Politics and the Populist Right: The New Cultural Conflict in Western Europe*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press: Ch. 1 (1-14).

### **Class 13 (April 26): Voting and Representation**

*What is the relationship between identity and voting? Between identity and political representation?*

Adam Przeworski. 1985. *Capitalism and Social Democracy*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch 1 (7-46).

Karen E. Ferree. 2010. *Framing the Race in South Africa: The Political Origins of Racial-Census Elections*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 1 (1-32).

Mala Htun. 2004. "Is Gender Like Ethnicity? The Political Representation of Identity Groups." *Perspectives on Politics* 2(3): 439-458.

Daniel N. Posner. 2007. "Regime Change and Ethnic Cleavages in Africa." *Comparative Political Studies* 40 (11): 1302-1327.

**Class 14 (May 3): Social Policy**

*What is the relationship between identity and social policy?*

Maria Victoria Murillo. 2001. *Labor Unions, Partisan Coalitions and Market Reforms in Latin America*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 1, 2 and 8 (1-26; 196-204).

Erik E. Bleich. 2003. *Race Politics in Britain and France: Ideas and Policymaking since the 1960s*. New York: Cambridge University Press: Ch. 1 and 7 (1-16 and 168-196).

Mala Htun and S. Laurel Weldon. 2012. "The Civic Origins of Progressive Policy Change: Combating Violence against Women in Global Perspective, 1975-2005." *American Political Science Review* 106 (3): 548-569.

Will Kymlicka and Keith Banting. 2006. "Immigration, Multiculturalism, and the Welfare State." *Ethics and International Affairs* 20 (3): 281-304. (For more data see: <http://www.queensu.ca/mcp/> )

Edward Miguel. 2004. "Tribe or Nation? Nation Building and Public Goods in Kenya versus Tanzania." *World Politics* 56: 327-62.